DELIVERABLE

Project Acronym: **ECLI-BG**

Grant Agreement number: **766158**

Project Title: **Implementation of ECLI Identifier in Bulgaria and interconnection with the e-Justice Portal**

D5.4 Expert Workshop

Authors:

Hristo Konstantinov	APIS
Irina Radoeva	APIS
Keti Bozukova	SUB

Revision History, Status, Abstract, Keywords, Statement of Originality

Revision History

Revision	Date	Author	Organisation	Description
0.1	05.10.2017	Hristo Konstantinov	APIS	First draft
0.2	09.10.2017	Irina Radoeva	APIS	Review
0.3	10.10.2017	Keti Bozukova	SUB	Review
1.0	12.10.2017	Hristo Konstantinov	APIS	Final draft

Date of delivery	Contractual:	30.09.2017	Actual:	12.10.2017
Status	final ☒ /draft ☐			

Abstract (for dissemination)	This document provides a concise overview of the expert workshop "The introduction of ECLI in Bulgaria in the context of the implementation of e-Justice" organised by the ECLI-BG project in Sofia on 4 October 2017.
Keywords	Case law, Bulgaria, ECLI, e-Justice

Table of Contents

1   Introduction

The organisation of the ECLI-BG expert workshop is part of the project dissemination and communication activities in Work package 5. The aim of the workshop was to introduce the ECLI-BG project to the relevant stakeholders and to present them the plans of the consortium partners for the introduction of ECLI in Bulgaria in the context of the Europe-wide efforts for ECLI implementation as well as in the perspective of the ongoing national projects on the introduction of e-Justice in the Bulgarian judiciary. The following section provides a brief overview of the event.

2   Workshop overview

The workshop was held in Sofia on 4 October 2017.

In the work plan, the event was planned to take place in project month 2 or 3. Since the project started on 1 July 2017, compliance with this schedule was no longer possible due to the judicial vacation in August and the first week of September. Hence, the earliest possible dates for organising the event were in the end of September. However, after coordinating this with the schedule of the two invited international experts, the ECLI-BG partners decided to fix the date of the workshop on 4 October.

The organisers invited 16 national experts with background in the fields of law and informatics (8 of them as speakers) to take part in the discussions. During the past decade, all these experts listed below have been actively involved in the process of introduction of information technologies and e-Justice in the Bulgarian judiciary:

- Vladislav Slavov, chairman of The Union of Bulgarian Jurists – legal expert, moderator of the workshop
- Hristo Konstantinov, deputy managing director of "Apis Europe" JSC – legal expert, presenter
- Boicho Georgiev, director of "Development and International Projects" department of "Apis Europe" JSC – legal expert, presenter
- Elka Atanasova, prosecutor, member of the Supreme Judicial Council (2012-2017) – presenter
- Pavel Andreev, head of "Information Systems" department at the Supreme Court of Cassation – IT expert, presenter
- Spas Manov, head of "Information Systems, Communication and Judicial Statistics" Department at the Supreme Administrative Court – IT expert, presenter
- Marin Koshutov – IT expert, presenter
- Jana Sharankova, inspector at the Inspectorate of the Minister of Justice under the Judicial System Act – legal expert, presenter
- Delina Dzondzorova, chief expert in "Security" department of the Ministry of Justice

- Dushana Zdravkova, freelance legal expert
- Keti Bozukova, lawyer at Sofia Bar
- Mario Mandzhukov, director "Business development" department of TechnoLogica JSC – IT expert
- Svetoslav Dantchev, system administrator of the Court of Appeal in Veliko Tarnovo
- Ivan Ivanov, managing director of "Abbaty" JSC – IT expert
- Dr. Tsvetanka Lozanova, chief assistant professor at the Institute for Legal Studies of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences
- Veselin Todorov, managing director of "Ciela Norma" JSC – IT expert.

Due to a subsequent commitment, Mr. Andreev was prevented from attending the seminar and his presentation was given by Marin Koshutov.

The ECLI-BG partners invited also two international experts with impressive experience in the field of ECLI implementation:

- Marc van Opijnen, adviser legal Informatics at the Publications Office of the Netherlands, manager of the BO-ECLI project and member of the Working Party on e-Law at the Council of the EU, and
- Tommaso Agnoloni, researcher at the Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, National Research Council (ITTIG-CNR), leader of the BO-ECLI project team implementing ECLI in Italy.

The final program of the seminar (see Annex I) was agreed with the speakers on 14 September. In the second half of September, the ECLI-BG partners sent approximately 300 regular mails and more than 700 electronic mails to invite stakeholders from the judiciary and public sector bodies as well as lawyers and other legal experts to participate as guests in the event. The invitation letter contained a brief presentation of the ECLI-BG project and referred to the attached program.

Regular mails were sent to the district courts in the regional centres of the country, all regional courts, courts of appeal and supreme courts, the General Prosecutor's and the regional prosecutors' offices, all ministries, the largest state agencies, the mayors of the regional cities and all regional governors. Electronic mails were sent to legal and IT experts in other public bodies, judges, prosecutors, lawyers at Sofia bar and the bar associations in the country, in-house legal counsel and legal consultants.

As a result of the intensive campaign, 104 participants in total[1] attended the workshop. The attendees included representatives of the three main target groups as follows:

- 12 judges and court staff (planned 15)
- 4 prosecutors (planned 10)
- 77 lawyers, in-house lawyers and legal experts (planned 75).

Among the attendees were also 11 experts in the field of IT and informatics. Each participant received a folder containing the workshop program and a leaflet presenting the project.

The number of representatives of the Bulgarian judiciary participating in the event, i.e. judges, court staff and prosecutors, was lower than initially planned. One of the reasons is the fact that ECLI seems to be considered by magistrates as stuff that is

---

[1] Including the speakers.

more technical. Therefore, ECLI-BG partners intend to improve the communication with this target group when organising the next two major project events – the international conference planned for April 2018 and the Round table discussion – planned for November 2018. Where possible, personal direct communication channels will used in order to convince magistrates of the practical advantages from the ECLI implementation.

Despite the fact that the representatives of the judiciary were less than expected, the organisers of the workshop were satisfied that the event was honoured by the chairwoman of the Court of Appeal in Burgas and former Minister of Justice Denitsa Valkova, the chairman of the Regional court of Sofia Philip Vladimirov, the deputy chairwoman of the Administrative court of Sofia Lubka Petrova and the chairman of the District court in Madan Dimitar Stratiev. Among the participants were also legal experts of senior management positions in the public administration.

All presentations given at the workshop are published at the project website at the following address: http://ecli-bg.eu/en/documents/. The presentations of the national experts are available in Bulgarian language only, whereas the presentations of the international experts are published both in English and Bulgarian languages.

Brief information about the workshop with photos from the event is published in the "News" section of the project website (http://ecli-bg.eu/en/2017/10/04/ecli-bg-workshop/) as well as on the websites of the partners Apis Europe and The Union of Bulgarian Jurists.

The materials of the workshop and the discussions will be published as a separate issue of the "Legal Tribune" magazine.

Annex – Workshop program

ECLI-BG INTERNATIONAL EXPERT WORKSHOP

The Introduction of ECLI in Bulgaria
in the Context of the Implementation of e-Justice

4th October 2017, Sofia, 7 Pirotska Str.

PROGRAM

9.00	*Registration*
9.30	*Opening of the workshop and welcome addresses*

Vladislav Slavov, Chairperson of the Central Council of The Union of Bulgarian Jurists

Desislava Ahladova, Deputy Minister of Justice

9.40	*The ECLI-BG project and the Implementation of ECLI in Bulgaria*

Hristo Konstantinov, Deputy Managing Director of Apis Europe JSC, ECLI-BG Project Manager

10.00	*The European Case Law Identifier – Gaining Support all over Europe*

Marc van Opijnen, Adviser Legal Informatics, Publications Office of the Netherlands, BO-ECLI Project Manager, Member of the Working Party on e-Law at the Council of the EU

10.40	*The Role of the Supreme Judicial Council as the Bulgarian ECLI Coordinator and the Author of the Legal Framework for the Introduction of the European Case Law Identifier and Implementer of the Project for the Development of a Centralised Information System of the Courts*

Elka Atanasova, member of the Supreme Judicial Council (2012-2017) and Project Manager of the project "Creation of a Model for the Optimisation of the Judicial Map of the Bulgarian Courts and Prosecution Offices and Development of a Centralised Information System of the Courts"

11.00	*ECLI Implementation in Italy: State of Play*
11.20	*Linking European Case-Law: BO-ECLI Parser, an Open Extensible Framework for Multilingual Legal Links Extraction*

Tommaso Agnoloni, Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, National Research Council (ITTIG-CNR), Florence

11.40	*The Free Extension "Link Detector" as an Assisting Tool for Legal Practitioners*

Boycho Georgiev, Director of "Development and International Projects" Department of Apis Europe JSC

12.00	*Online Access to the Case Law of the Supreme Court of Cassation – State of Play and Plans for Future Developments*

Pavel Andreev, Head of "Information Systems" Department at the Supreme Court of Cassation

12.10	*The Single Case Management System of the Administrative Courts*

Spas Manov, Head of "Information Systems, Communication and Judicial Statistics" Department at the Supreme Administrative Court

12.20	*The Single e-Justice Portal and Its Connection with the Centralized Web Portal for Publication of Judicial Acts*

Marin Koshutov, IT Expert, Participant in the "Single e-Justice Portal" Project of the Supreme Judicial Council

12.40 *Presentation of the Project "Enhancement of Guarantees for a Fair Trial in Enforcement Proceedings by Building an Information System"*

Jana Sharankova, Inspector at the Inspectorate of the Minister of Justice under the Judicial System Act, Project Manager

12.50 ***Discussion***

Close of the Workshop and Lunch